On the value of gentle video surveillance
Manal Hreib, Ido Erev & Miriam Erez

- Closed circle TV (**CCTV**) are heavily used to increase public safety.

- They are particularly popular in the UK: 4.2 Millions CCTVs, one for each 14 citizens in 2009!

- Yet, not everybody agree that CCTV are effective.

- The current research builds on basic *research of decisions from experience (*Hertwig & Erev, 2009) in attempt to clarify the conditions under which CCTV are likely to be effective.

- conducted with "*City Without Violence*" .*CWV* is a unit of the Israeli Ministry of Public security . operates CCTVs to reduce violence and vandalism in most Israeli towns.

The parking lot puzzle
(Welsh & Farrington, 2009)

- Meta analysis of 44 large scale field experiments reveals a large difference between the effectiveness of CCTV in parking lots, and other places.

- CCTV was found to reduce car related crimes in protected lots by 50%, but it appears to have no effect on violence related crimes in city centers.

- Under the common explanation of this pattern it reflects the difference between "*planned*" and "*emotional*" crimes (Shepherd & Sivarajasingam, 2005). Most car related thefts are planned, and for that reason reflect high sensitivity to CCTV, whereas most violence related crimes are more emotional and reflect limited planning.

- We explore the role of a second contributor to the parking lot puzzle: The distinct detection rates.

The detection rates hypothesis

▪We hypothesize that the parking lot puzzle reflects the large difference between the detection rates of the distinct crimes

▪When a car is stolen or damaged, in a protected lot, the owner is likely to inform the police, and the police is likely to examine the tape.

▪In contrast, the probability that the typical violence incident will be detected is rather low. The police is likely to see the tape if someone was seriously hurt, but not in the case of the typical incident.

▪Thus, assuming that criminals, like the typical clicking subjects, underweight rare events, they will show high sensitivity to CCTV in a parking lots, but not in other places.

The original objective of current research

▪Our original goal was to test this hypothesis in an intervention study designed to reduce vandalism in playgrounds located in Bedouin villages near Beer Sheva.

▪Specifically, we planed to make the playgrounds more similar to parking lots by encouraging the people in charge to give gentle punishments to the vandalists.

- The are almost no playgrounds
- Almost no detections.

Operation rooms

▪ Evaluation to the operation rooms reveals that each operator is required to look at dozens boring screen, and can also surf the net, and watch TV. The TV was on even when the manager of City Without Violence came to visit the center.
▪Evaluation of the CCTV's "success story" shows that
All of them involve helping the police solving crimes
that were detected in the area of the crime.
▪We could not find success that start with a detection of a crime in the center!

The revised goal of current research

▪*First*, we try to use gentle rule enforcement to affect the operators. Specifically, we will ask them to send us pictures of the screens for selected CCTV in the beginning and the end of each shift. And, in the case of the change, a clip with the act of vandalism.
▪*Study 1* will examine the effect of this intervention by comparing the detection rates in several CCTV operation rooms in Israel.

▪*Second,* we are renovating two playgrounds in each of six Bedouin villages (adding water fountain and shaded areas to seat, and CCTV).
▪*Study 2* will compare alternative methods to protect the additions.

Thank you